Discursive Struggles over World Order: Exploring Encounters between Islamists and the West

Dissertation

zur Erlangung des akademischen Grades einer Doktorin der Wirtschafts- und Sozialwissenschaften (Dr. rer. pol.) an der Fakultät Wirtschafts- und Sozialwissenschaften der Helmut-Schmidt-Universität / Universität der Bundeswehr Hamburg

vorgelegt von

Hanna Marieke Pfeifer M.A.

aus Altdorf bei Nürnberg

Hamburg 2017

Erstgutachterin: Prof. Dr. Anna Geis, Helmut-Schmidt-Universität / Universität der Bundeswehr Hamburg

Zweitgutachter: Prof. Dr. Stephan Stetter, Universität der Bundeswehr München
1. Introduction: Islamists and the World Order – Why Ask?
   1.1. Research Problem and Question
   1.2. Academic and Political Relevance of this Thesis
   1.3. Overview of the Chapters

2. Religion, Secularism and International Relations: Overview
   2.1. The Secularisation Paradigm: Religion in Social and Political Theory
      2.1.1. Early Sociology of Religion: Modernisation and Secularisation
      2.1.2. Political Liberalism and Post-Secularism: Normative Dimensions
      2.1.3. Revisiting the Secularisation Paradigm
   2.2. Religion in International Relations and Peace and Conflict Studies
      2.2.1. The Ambiguous Role of Religion for Peace and Conflict
      2.2.2. Religion in IR Theory
   2.3. Deconstructing Binaries: The Politics of Secularism in IR

3. Islamism in International Relations and Beyond: A Contested Term
   3.1. A Meta-Perspective on the Use of Islamism in Academic Discourse
   3.2. Historical Evolvement of Islamism
      3.2.1. The Historical Emergence and Intellectual Resources of Islamism
      3.2.2. Terminological ‘Neighbours’ of Islamism in Historical Perspective
   3.3. Classifying Contemporary Islamists

4. Theory: A Discursive Concept of World Order
   4.1. Constructivism and a Discursive Concept of World Order
   4.2. Elements of World Order
   4.3. Western Discourses on World Order
      4.3.1. Sovereignty
      4.3.2. Legitimacy
      4.3.3. Utopias and Dystopias
   4.4. Conclusion: Operationalising the World Order
5. Methodology: Analysing Discursive Constructions of World Order

5.1. Locating the Study in the Field of Discourse Analysis in IR

5.1.1. Critical Discourse Analysis

5.1.2. Poststructuralist Discourse Analysis

5.1.3. Level of Analysis in Discourse Analyses in IR

5.2. Steps of Analysis

5.2.1. Qualitative Content Analysis ‘in the Service’ of Discourse Analysis

5.2.2. Coding for Multiple Selves and Others

5.3. Case Selection, Period of Analysis and Material

5.3.1. Ennahda and Hezbollah as Case Studies in the Post-Arab Uprisings Era

5.3.2. Units of Analysis and Sampling Strategy

5.3.3. Interviews as Contextualising Material

5.4. Scope and Limits of the Study

6. Case Study 1: Tunisian Ennahda

6.1. Introduction

6.1.1. Emergence and History of the Tunisian Ennahda Movement / Party

6.1.2. Tunisia’s Trajectory 2011-2016

Phase 1: Post-revolutionary Phase and First Elections (Jan 2011-Nov 2011)
Phase 2: Troika Government I under Hamadi Jebali (Nov 2011-Feb 2013)
Phase 4: NCA Crisis and Rapprochement with Nidaa Tounes (Aug 2013-Jan 2014)
Phase 5: Elections and National Unity Government I (Jan 2014-Feb 2015)
Phase 6: National Unity Government II and Rise of Terrorism (Feb 2015-Dec 2016)

6.1.3. Ennahda’s Organisational Structure

6.2. Sovereignty Claims in Ennahda’s Discourse

6.2.1. Summary of the Results

6.2.2. Categories and Codes in Detail

6.2.2.1. Popular Sovereignty

6.2.2.2. Absolute Sovereignty

6.2.2.3. Shared Sovereignty

6.2.2.4. Conditional Sovereignty
6.3. Legitimacy Claims in Ennahda’s Discourse 146

6.3.1. Summary of the Results 146
6.3.2. Categories and Codes in Detail 147
6.3.2.1. Illegitimacy of the Old Regime 147
6.3.2.2. Individual-based Legitimacy 150
6.3.2.3. Output Legitimacy 160
6.3.2.4. Community-based Legitimacy 167
6.3.2.5. Consensus-based Legitimacy 174
6.3.2.6. Agonistic Legitimacy 180
6.3.3. Summary and Preliminary Conclusions 180

6.4. Utopia and Dystopia in Ennahda’s Discourse 183

6.4.1. Summary of the Results 183
6.4.2. Categories and Codes in Detail 184
6.4.2.1. Tunisian Liberation 184
6.4.2.2. Arab-Islamic Liberation 193
6.4.2.3. Tunisia as a Model and Regional Leader 195
6.4.2.4. Helpful Outside Interference 197
6.4.2.5. Threats to Tunisia, Arab-Islamic Decay and Global Threats 197
6.4.2.6. Tunisian Exceptionalism 210
6.4.2.7. Harmful Outside Interference 212
6.4.3. Summary and Preliminary Conclusions 213

6.5. Conclusion Ennahda’s Discursive Construction of World Order 214

7. Case Study 2: Lebanese Hezbollah 221

7.1. Introduction 221

7.1.1. Emergence and History of the Lebanese Hezbollah 221
7.1.2. Lebanon’s Trajectory 2011-2016 231
Phase 1: STL and Mikati Government (Jan 2011-Dec 2011) 231
Phase 2: Escalation in Syria and Spill-overs to Lebanon (Jan 2012-Mar 2013) 232
Phase 3: Hezbollah in Syria and National Unity Government (Apr 2013-Feb 2014) 234
Phase 5: War in Yemen and Increasing Regional Tensions (Feb 2015-Jan 2016) 237
Phase 6: Presidential Elections and Pressure on Hezbollah (Jan 2016-Dec 2016) 239
7.1.3. Hezbollah’s Organisational Structure 241
7.2. Sovereignty Claims in Hezbollah’s Discourse  
7.2.1. Summary of the Results  246  
7.2.2. Categories and Codes in Detail  246  
7.2.2.1. Absolute Sovereignty  246  
7.2.2.2. Popular Sovereignty  249  
7.2.2.3. Shared Sovereignty  251  
7.2.2.4. Conditional Sovereignty  252  

7.3. Legitimacy Claims in Hezbollah’s Discourse  253  
7.3.1. Summary of the Results  253  
7.3.2. Categories and Codes in Detail  254  
7.3.2.1. Deliberative Legitimacy  254  
7.3.2.2. Individual-based Legitimacy  268  
7.3.2.3. Output Legitimacy  273  
7.3.2.4. Agonistic Legitimacy  276  
7.3.2.5. Community-based Legitimacy  276  
7.3.2.6. Violence  282  
7.3.3. Summary and Preliminary Conclusions  302  

7.4. Utopia and Dystopia in Hezbollah’s Discourse  304  
7.4.1. Summary of the Results  304  
7.4.2. Categories and Codes in Detail  305  
7.4.2.1. Common Fate of Arab-Islamic World  305  
7.4.2.2. Good vs. Evil  306  
7.4.2.3. Schemes of the Oppressors  308  
7.4.2.4. Victory of the Oppressed  318  

7.5. Conclusion: Hezbollah’s Construction of World Order  322  

8. Conclusion: Islamists, the West and the World Order  327  
8.1. Comparing Results: Convergence and Divergence in the Case Studies  328  
8.1.1. Sovereignty  328  
8.1.2. Legitimacy  330  
8.1.3. Utopia and Dystopia, Self and Other  338  
8.2. Theoretical Results and Desiderata  344  

9. Literature  349